

VZCZCXYZ0000  
OO RUEHWEB

DE RUEHNO #0326/01 2551059  
ZNY CCCCC ZZH  
O 111059Z SEP 08  
FM USMISSION USNATO  
TO RUEHC/SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 2236  
INFO RUEHZG/NATO EU COLLECTIVE IMMEDIATE  
RUEHKV/AMEMBASSY KYIV IMMEDIATE 0157  
RUEHMO/AMEMBASSY MOSCOW IMMEDIATE 6100  
RUEHSI/AMEMBASSY TBILISI IMMEDIATE 5672  
RHMFISS/HQ USEUCOM VAHINGEN GE IMMEDIATE  
RHEFDIA/DIA WASHDC IMMEDIATE  
RHEHNSC/NSC WASHDC IMMEDIATE  
RUEKJCS/JOINT STAFF WASHDC IMMEDIATE  
RUEKJCS/SECDEF WASHINGTON DC IMMEDIATE  
RUEAIIA/CIA WASHDC IMMEDIATE  
RUEHNO/USDELMC BRUSSELS BE IMMEDIATE  
RHMFISS/USNMR SHAPE BE IMMEDIATE

C O N F I D E N T I A L USNATO 000326

SIPDIS

E.O. 12958: DECL: 01/05/2017  
TAGS: [NATO](#) [PREL](#) [MOPS](#) [GG](#) [RS](#)  
SUBJECT: SENATOR LUGAR DISCUSSES RUSSIA/GEORGIA WITH  
DIVIDED ALLIES

Classified By: Ambassador Kurt Volker for reasons 1.4 (b), (d)

11. (SBU) SUMMARY: Senator Lugar and staff had a series of productive meetings with the NATO Secretary General, SACEUR, the principal NATO supporters of Georgia, the German Permanent Representative to NATO, and a dinner that included notable EU, NATO, and bilateral dignitaries. The Senator stressed the importance of Article 5 of the Washington Treaty, but cautioned against cutting off cooperation with Russia that is in our interest, such as the Nunn-Lugar Cooperative Threat Reduction Program. Allies and EU leaders expressed sharp divisions on how to deal with Russia. The new Allies tended towards a harsher response to Russia and increased Article 5 contingency planning at NATO, while old Allies and the EU saw a more limited tool box focused on economic and financial costs for Russia. End Summary.

-----  
LET'S NOT SHOOT OURSELVES IN THE FOOT  
-----

12. (SBU) In his September 3-4 meetings at NATO and his dinner with EU, NATO, and Belgian leaders, Senator Lugar advocated continuing cooperation that was in our interest. For example, he cited the Nunn-Lugar Cooperative Threat Reduction Program and cooperation on Iran and counter-terrorism as the types of endeavor that should remain above the political fray. The Senator said Allies and Russia must be reminded that our commitment to Article 5 is beyond doubt.

13. (SBU) Senator Lugar elaborated on the economic costs to Russia of the war with Georgia. He pointed out the vulnerability of the Russian stock market and its capital flows; Russia is now part of the world economy and cannot ignore its impact. The Senator recommended that the EU develop a comprehensive energy policy to mitigate dependency on Russian energy and expressed strong support for the Nabucco pipeline.

-----  
NEW ALLIES (AND UKRAINE) FOCUS ON ARTICLE 5  
-----

14. (SBU) The Baltic countries pointed out that light, expeditionary forces in Georgia had been unsuccessful in repelling the Russian attack, arguing that perhaps NATO should focus on heavier, static forces for territorial defense. The Ukrainian Ambassador to NATO said Kyiv is drawing clear lessons from the Georgian experience and that

collective security is Ukraine's only option. He said that Medvedev's recent letter to President Yushchenko contained the harshest language he had seen in his career in any diplomatic correspondence. Czech NATO Perm Rep Fule suggested that NATO Political Directors meet to develop a coherent Russian policy, called for Article 5 contingency planning, and pledged that the Czech EU Presidency would promote EU-NATO policy cohesion.

15. (C) The UK NATO Perm Rep said that Russia must pay a price for its misbehavior, but the Alliance must be judicious in assuring any measure hurts Russia more than the Alliance. He sympathized with the Baltic countries' call for a risk assessment, but argued that NATO transformation towards expeditionary forces and the responsibilities of Article 5 are compatible goals.

-----  
OLD ALLIES (AND EU) FOCUSED ON ECON TOOLS  
-----

16. (SBU) In a separate one-on-one meeting with Senator Lugar, German NATO Perm Rep Brandenburg claimed that the West's only effective means to pressure Russia are economic and financial. He said that NATO, however, is not "a major player" in this conflict, adding that participation in the NATO-Russia Council should not be a tool by which to pressure Russia. Senator Lugar responded that Allied unity is the key to getting Russia's attention. Brandenburg said that we need Russian support for the Security Council renewal of the mandate for ISAF, because without it Germany could not keep its troops in Afghanistan. Showing tepid German support for

Ukraine's Membership Action Plan aspirations, Brandenburg drew the Senator's attention to the political crisis in Kyiv, commenting that the "Ukrainians have a habit of shooting themselves in the foot."

17. (C) EU Commissioner Ferrero-Waldner emphasized the success of Sarkozy's six-point plan in ending the fighting in Georgia and stressed the need to bridge the internal EU divide on Russian policy. In particular, she said, withdrawing the Russia/EU agreement required Russia to pay a price and called for bringing the Nabucco pipeline forward. The Italian Perm Rep to the EU Feroci said it would be difficult to unify old and new members of the EU on Russia, and suggested that the EU could replace NATO as a framework for Georgian and Ukrainian integration.  
WEINROD